

EXHIBIT 9

6/19/23, 12:42 PM

Gmail - Re: Resignation Letter



Debbie Ryan <wallstryan@gmail.com>

Re: Resignation Letter

1 message

Debbie Ryan <wallstryan@gmail.com>
To: Samuel Randazzo <randazzosc@gmail.com>
Bcc: WallStRyan@gmail.com

Sat, Nov 21, 2020 at 12:46 PM

Got it! I thought maybe Roger would be your "man". He will do a great job for you.

Debbie

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 21, 2020, at 12:45 PM, Samuel Randazzo <randazzosc@gmail.com> wrote:

Pretty stressful few days which started Monday at 6:00 when 10-12 FBI agents with guns drawn announced their arrival at our home. But, Carol and I are handing it and doing better each day. Neighbors, friends (like you), family, PUCO staff and people I have worked for over the years have been great. Roger Sugarman is my new hero. So, onward!

Thanks for asking. Feel free to call the number I gave you.

Sambo

On Sat, Nov 21, 2020 at 12:38 PM Debbie Ryan <wallstryan@gmail.com> wrote:
Got it. Thanks. You doing ok?

Debbie

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 21, 2020, at 12:37 PM, Samuel Randazzo <randazzosc@gmail.com> wrote:

Thanks - the number for my phone which the FB I does not have is (614) 307-9123.

On Sat, Nov 21, 2020 at 12:35 PM Debbie Ryan <wallstryan@gmail.com> wrote:
I second that!

Debbie

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 20, 2020, at 5:00 PM, Ed Hess <edhess@wowway.com> wrote:

Two more thoughts.
God-damn-it that was a well written letter. Proud to know you.

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 20, 2020, at 10:17 AM, Samuel Randazzo
<randazzosc@gmail.com> wrote:

6/19/23, 12:42 PM

Gmail - Re: Resignation Letter

Please see attached letter.

Sam

<Resignation - Honorable Michael D.pdf>

--
Sam Randazzo
sam@sustain-ohio.com
614.395.4268

--
Sam Randazzo
sam@sustain-ohio.com
614.395.4268

EXHIBIT 10

Short Message Report

Conversations: 1	Participants: 3
Total Messages: 6	Date Range: 12/18/2018

Outline of Conversations



NODISPLAY 6 messages on 12/18/2018 • Charles Jones Jr • Michael Dowling • Sam Randazzo

**Exhibit
00081**

Messages in chronological order (times are shown in GMT -05:00)

	NODISPLAY	
SR	Sam Randazzo	12/18/2018, 9:53 PM
	2019 1,633,333	
	2020 600,000	
	2021 600,000	
	2022 600,000	
	2023 600,000	
	2024 300,000	
	Total 4,333,333	
	Thanks for the visit. Good to see both of you.	
MD	Michael Dowling	9:55 PM
	Got it, Sam. Good seeing you as well. Thanks for the hospitality. Cool condo.	
CJ	Charles Jones Jr	10:30 PM
	Sam,	
	Do you send an invoice every year?	
SR	Sam Randazzo	10:32 PM
	Yes - the current cycle has me sending an invoice for the scheduled annual payment in Juke or July. And there is an existing PO number associated with the invoice.	
CJ	Charles Jones Jr	10:33 PM
	You send it to Brad Bingaman?	
SR	Sam Randazzo	10:37 PM
	I believe Brad is the person who received and processed the invoice last year (2018). In the past, we actually split the payment into two invoices to stay, I think, within payment authorization limits. I don't know if there has been any change. Prior to that, Ebony received the invoices.	

EXHIBIT 11

Short Message Report

Conversations: 1	Participants: 3
Total Messages: 6	Date Range: 12/19/2018

Outline of Conversations



NODISPLAY 6 messages on 12/19/2018 • Charles Jones Jr • Michael Dowling • Sam Randazzo

**Exhibit
00082**

Messages in chronological order (times are shown in GMT -05:00)**NODISPLAY**

SR **Sam Randazzo** 12/19/2018, 8:29 AM

I checked this morning and Brad did handle the most recent invoices.

CJ **Charles Jones Jr** 9:02 AM

We're gonna get this handled this year, paid in full, no discount. Don't forget about us or Hurricane Chuck may show up on your doorstep! Of course, no guarantee he won't show up sometime anyway.



Image: IMG_6002.jpeg (53 KB)

SR **Sam Randazzo** 9:05 AM

Made me laugh - you guys are welcome anytime and any wherel can open the door. Let me know how you want me to structure the invoices. Thanks

SR **Sam Randazzo** 10:47 AM

I think I said this last night but just in case - if asked by the administration to go for the Chair spot, I would say yes.

CJ **Charles Jones Jr** 10:59 AM

Forget it - we're not settling up with you then. Just kidding. 😊 You did say it and we know you wouldn't blind side us. When the Gov Elect asked me about attributes I listed integrity, work ethic, creativity, thick skin, circumspection in public statements. You fit all of those. The #1 thing I emphasized was stability in leadership there which is what prompted the debate between me and Mike as to how many Chair's Kasich had. I would only ask that if you do it, make a commitment to do it through his first term so that the entire organization can stabilize. It's been very difficult with the revolving door that's been there. To only do it for a year or so, the State and FE would be better off with Jason and you helping make him successful.

SR **Sam Randazzo** 11:13 AM

Thanks for the humor.

Should I be asked, I would commit to serve a full term and agree to leave early/resign promptly if asked to do so. I always ask Commissioner applicants this question. I agree with your comments on a need to stabilize the agency and have said this in public presentations. I think the need for stabilization extends to the legislature and the executive branch. There are a lot of well-intended people but they don't know enough about the subject and details to translate their good intentions into useful action steps.

Blindsiding people in this business is a quick way to get blindsided yourself.

My willingness to serve a supportive role with Jason remains.

EXHIBIT 12

Short Message Report

Conversations: 1	Participants: 3
Total Messages: 12	Date Range: 11/10/2019

Outline of Conversations



NODISPLAY 12 messages on 11/10/2019 • Charles Jones • Charles Jones Jr • Matt Evans

**Exhibit
00101**

Messages in chronological order (times are shown in GMT -05:00)**NODISPLAY****CJ****Charles Jones**

11/10/2019, 9:16 PM

So am I chump change now? First hockey game came and went. No answer on Penn State. This O U board must be overwhelming you!

ME**Matt Evans**

9:39 PM

Yea I fucked up. That happens a lot. You are well aware of that.

I didn't have the Las Vegas game anyway. I will procure the rest tomorrow. What email should I send them to?

ME**Matt Evans**

9:40 PM

And how many for Penn State?

ME**Matt Evans**

9:41 PM

4. Just saw it. Parking pass also coming if needed

CJ**Charles Jones**

9:42 PM

4 for a Penn State. Email for Jackets is nlitwino@gmail.com.

ME**Matt Evans**

9:42 PM

And yes. Saving Higher Ed is quite time consuming.

ME**Matt Evans**

9:43 PM

Still easier than saving you guys over the years.

CJ**Charles Jones**

9:44 PM

And one more BIG favor - which is why I'm texting you tonight. Need Cam Mitchell's exact recipe for Butter Cake at Ocean Prime. It's worth a lot to my wife and thus me!

ME**Matt Evans**

9:46 PM

Shit. That may be a tough one. I'll ask Cameron, but he is not a very cooperative guy.

CJ**Charles Jones**

9:47 PM

And, the FE rescue project is not over. At EEI financial conference. Stock is gonna get hit with Ohio 2024. Need Sam to get rid of the "Ohio 2024" hole.

CJ**Charles Jones**

9:47 PM

There's probably a server you could sweet talk.

ME**Matt Evans**

10:07 PM

It's never over. I get that.

I'm ready to fire away but I hear nothing from Akron.

I'll try with anyone at Mitchell's.

EXHIBIT 13

Short Message Report

Conversations: 1	Participants: 2
Total Messages: 8	Date Range: 11/15/2019

Outline of Conversations



NODISPLAY 8 messages on 11/15/2019 • Charles Jones • Michael Dowling

**Exhibit
00102**

Messages in chronological order (times are shown in GMT -05:00)

	NODISPLAY	
MD	Michael Dowling	11/15/2019, 2:01 PM
	I spoke with Sam today. Told me 2024 issue will be handled next Thursday (November 21).	
CJ	Charles Jones	2:04 PM
	Great. Any idea yet on the "handle"?	
MD	Michael Dowling	2:18 PM
	??	
CJ	Charles Jones	2:19 PM
	Handled next Thursday. How handled?	
CJ	Charles Jones	2:19 PM
	I got it in 80% of EEI meetings.	
MD	Michael Dowling	2:22 PM
	Yeah. We spoke today because he wanted to know what we said to Steve Fleishman. Steve has a call into Sam and Sam wanted to understand what we told Steve before Sam called him back. I got the sense from talking to Irene that 2024 came up a lot. In any event, he's going to make the requirement to file go away, but I do not know specifically how he plans to do it.	
CJ	Charles Jones	2:25 PM
	I told Fleishman that "I have zero worry about a rate decrease in 2024". Told him that I knew generically that Sam, Staff, and Legislature are looking at changes to how future rate making might be done, but I don't know details.	
MD	Michael Dowling	2:29 PM
	That's exactly what Irene told me. Great.	

EXHIBIT 14

Short Message Report

Conversations: 1	Participants: 2
Total Messages: 4	Date Range: 11/22/2019

Outline of Conversations



NODISPLAY 4 messages on 11/22/2019 • Charles Jones Jr • Sam Randazzo

**Exhibit
00104**

Messages in chronological order (times are shown in GMT -05:00)**NODISPLAY**

CJ **Charles Jones Jr** 11/22/2019, 4:51 PM
Thank you!!



Image: Screenshot 2019-11-22 at 4.47.15 PM.png (326 KB)

SR **Sam Randazzo** 5:01 PM
Ha - as you know, what goes up may come down.
Matt helped. Thanks for the note. Spoke to mike last night.

CJ **Charles Jones Jr** 5:16 PM
Every little bit helps. Those guys are good but it wouldn't happen without you. My Mom taught me to say Thank You.

SR **Sam Randazzo** 5:19 PM
Thanks

EXHIBIT 15

[Submitted *In Camera* Pursuant to §8 of the
Amended Stipulated Protective Order (ECF 411)]

EXHIBIT 16

Short Message Report

Conversations: 1	Participants: 3
Total Messages: 14	Date Range: 1/30/2019

Outline of Conversations



NODISPLAY 14 messages on 1/30/2019 • Charles Jones • Charles Jones Jr • Michael Dowling

**Exhibit
00087**

Messages in chronological order (times are shown in GMT -05:00)**NODISPLAY**

MD **Michael Dowling** 1/30/2019, 6:49 PM
FYI. Serious stuff.

MD **Michael Dowling** 6:49 PM
<https://youtu.be/spHAp7YUsOw>

Attachment: A55F301E-0F8B-475D-A605-5113FB29A691.pluginPayloadAttachment (15 KB)

Attachment: 96993BD2-F3A1-4AD2-ACBA-A2542446B0BE.pluginPayloadAttachment (12 KB)

CJ **Charles Jones** 6:52 PM
it's enviro bs. You don't think they would really care about it?

MD **Michael Dowling** 6:55 PM
Idk how Gov will respond. If he gives in on this, he'll see a lot more of this crap on every issue from a wide variety of groups.

MD **Michael Dowling** 6:57 PM
Had a very long talk with Pat. I didn't bring up "the" issue. Fred and I both concluded that it might piss him off so much that he's pull out.

MD **Michael Dowling** 6:58 PM
Mike Dawson said the Gov won't ever see the Sam video.

CJ **Charles Jones** 7:07 PM
That makes sense.

MD **Michael Dowling** 9:35 PM
Chuck - Sam Randazzo is going to pull out of the PUCO process ASAP and it's related to a disclosure on a FES bankruptcy filing. Reporters called FE today inquiring about the relationship between FES and a group called the Sustainability Funding Alliance of Ohio. You can guess the rest.

CJ **Charles Jones** 9:37 PM
Great. Now we have none on the list.

MD **Michael Dowling** 9:42 PM
This is awful. The FES bankruptcy filing names that group and Sam names the same group on a financial disclosure statement. Unreal. I don't know why it was listed in the FES bankruptcy filing. The payments we made year-end '18 came from FE Corp. Services.

CJ **Charles Jones** 9:48 PM
Nobody on that list capable of being chair means Asim stays chair for a year? Was he being paid by FES up til the bankruptcy?

CJ **Charles Jones** 9:49 PM
Back to legislative fix for Ohio hole.

CJ **Charles Jones** 10:06 PM
Very unhappy they made us take Jason off the list. Always need a backup plan.

MD **Michael Dowling** 10:09 PM
They're going to mad at Sam (and hopefully not us) for not disclosing the financial relationship.
That's Sam responsibility.

EXHIBIT 17

Short Message Report

Conversations: 1	Participants: 3
Total Messages: 12	Date Range: 1/31/2019

Outline of Conversations

 **NODISPLAY** 12 messages on 1/31/2019 • Charles Jones • Charles Jones Jr • Michael Dowling

**Exhibit
00088**

Messages in chronological order (times are shown in GMT -05:00)

 NODISPLAY		
MD	Michael Dowling I'm here.	1/31/2019, 6:39 AM
CJ	Charles Jones Stop up	6:39 AM
MD	Michael Dowling Nominating Council has been delayed and is now in Executive Session.	9:10 AM
MD	Michael Dowling Check email	9:40 AM
CJ	Charles Jones Any word?	11:45 AM
MD	Michael Dowling Not yet. Hoping soon. You'll be my first call.	11:45 AM
MD	Michael Dowling That bullet grazed the temple.	12:33 PM
CJ	Charles Jones Forced DeWine/Husted to perform battlefield triage. It's a rough game.	12:35 PM
MD	Michael Dowling When this is over - which may be as early as tomorrow - gov is likely to call you. Josh is begging me to ask that you act surprised to everything he says to you.	12:40 PM
CJ	Charles Jones I will be surprised since I have no idea what he'll want to talk about.	12:42 PM
MD	Michael Dowling From Justin: I will send an email in a minute, but Sam got the most votes. He got 11 votes which was unanimous because Shannon Jones was absent from the vote. The other three candidates are Gene Krebs (8 votes), Dennis Deters (7 votes), and Bryce McKenney (6 votes).	12:54 PM
MD	Michael Dowling Last night, Sen Manchin told Mike Eckard that he would reach out to Sen Murkowski to coordinate support for Pat. Today, after a conversation I had with Corey, we agreed it made sense for Manchin to call Mulvanie. Mike Eckard is making that request of Joe today. Wanted u to know in case he calls you.	2:25 PM

EXHIBIT 18

Short Message Report

Conversations: 1	Participants: 2
Total Messages: 2	Date Range: 2/1/2019

Outline of Conversations



NODISPLAY 2 messages on 2/1/2019 • Charles Jones • Sam Randazzo

**Exhibit
00089**

Messages in chronological order (times are shown in GMT -05:00)

 **NODISPLAY**

CJ **Charles Jones** 2/1/2019, 8:21 AM
Most of the media coverage is very fair. There will be some shots taken but that's inevitable. Hang in there til it's done and it will quiet quickly. 

SR **Sam Randazzo** 8:22 AM
Thanks Chuck

EXHIBIT 19

Short Message Report

Conversations: 1	Participants: 3
Total Messages: 15	Date Range: 2/4/2019

Outline of Conversations



NODISPLAY 15 messages on 2/4/2019 • +13302854513 • Charles Jones • Matt Evans

**Exhibit
00090**

Messages in chronological order (times are shown in GMT -05:00)

 NODISPLAY		
#	+13302854513	2/4/2019, 12:10 PM
	Hey. You have any Cincinnati Arena connections?	
ME	Matt Evans	12:11 PM
	Not that I can think of	
ME	Matt Evans	12:12 PM
	Area or arena?	
#	+13302854513	12:12 PM
	Arena	
	Tom Segura	
	Aronoff Center, Proctor and Gamble Hall	
	Feb. 15, 7:30 pm or 10:00 pm	
#	+13302854513	12:13 PM
	I'll check some other sources.	
ME	Matt Evans	12:58 PM
	That a show? I can take care of that.	
#	+13302854513	1:34 PM
	It is. Comedy I think but I also think sold out. 2 tickets for my Son who is going there for his anniversary.	
ME	Matt Evans	1:34 PM
	I'm on it.	
#	+13302854513	1:36 PM
	Thanks. You da man! Need to get Sam done. PJM just hired another anti- generation leader.	
ME	Matt Evans	1:36 PM
	At least he doesn't have to pretend anymore.	
ME	Matt Evans	1:43 PM
	10:00 show. I'll forward them when I get them. 2nd Row. Next time I'll do better.	
ME	Matt Evans	1:47 PM
	Hi there - Here are your tickets for Tom Segura Tickets. Just print your tickets and bring them to the event.	
	<i>Attachment: Tom Segura Tickets.pdf (328 KB)</i>	
#	+13302854513	1:51 PM
	You're good!! Now work on the Sam/Jason parlay. Once Sam is in he'll help with Jason and my	

Speaker friend will too. He had Tony George give me a D name and I said no until next year.

ME **Matt Evans** 1:53 PM
I just threatened to pull out of the solar project because of AEP's behavior. I would be surprised if the blow up my coal contract.

ME **Matt Evans** 1:53 PM
What's driving Nick so hard?

EXHIBIT 20

Short Message Report

Conversations: 1	Participants: 2
Total Messages: 4	Date Range: 2/5/2019

Outline of Conversations



NODISPLAY 4 messages on 2/5/2019 • Charles Jones Jr • Sam Randazzo

**Exhibit
00091**

Messages in chronological order (times are shown in GMT -05:00)

	NODISPLAY	
CJ	Charles Jones Jr Congratulations!	2/5/2019, 6:41 AM
SR	Sam Randazzo Thanks Chuck - the last four days have been tuff - AEP was tossing a lot of stuff at the wall to see if anything would stick. Thanks goes to some great good friends. I don't know what AEP does next but it has hurt itself significantly with the new administration.	7:07 AM
CJ	Charles Jones Jr I agree and I know the new Speaker has no love lost for them either. I think Nick misses Bob Powers a lot more than he even knows. Bob was a little more worldly in how he looked at things.	7:59 AM
SR	Sam Randazzo Yep - and Pablo Vegas	7:59 AM